

Hayle Supermarkets – Comments and Issues arising from Strategic Planning Committee’s Public Meeting – 19th January 2011

Speaker	Issue	Response (Where appropriate)
1	Air Quality - Will Cornwall Council take insurance in case anyone with respiratory problems becomes ill from pollution created by stationary gridlocked traffic within Hayle?	<p>CC Highways Whilst that is a highways issue in the broadest sense and we try to limit traffic congestion against saved policies, the monitoring of this would be an environmental health issue and colleagues there should provide an answer to this as well. Equally, allowing a supermarket within a town reduces the overall carbon footprint as there are journey saving times as customers do not have to travel to nearby centres to shop.</p>
2	Planning – Hayle has no elected representative on the Strategic Planning Committee	Local elected members will be entitled to speak at the planning committee
3	<p>Adverse impacts on Angarrack include traffic on A30, flooding and nature conservation Operate local retail business and concern about the effects of supermarket development on the existing retail trade in Hayle. “Out of town” has negative impact where as “in towns” can have positive impact. Out of town will pick up passing A30 Trade and provide no stimulus for Hayle town centre rather the opposite. GVA report supports this view and in town development in Hayle. Do you want Hayle to become another Redruth or Penryn? Do you want to concrete the countryside and leave the centre derelict?</p>	<p>CC Highways The effects of all the schemes are being considered on this junction and roundabout and primarily the HA are involved here at this point but we are considering how best to address the issues here and have asked the applicants to examine it.</p> <p>Environment Agency We are satisfied that the drainage from the development would not increase the risk to surrounding properties provided that a condition is attached to any planning permission which is issued. There would therefore be no risk of flooding to properties in Angarrack.</p> <p>GVA Grimley All of the supermarket proposals will divert expenditure from stores in Hayle’s two town centres. The proposals at the South Quay and Jewsons sites will have a lower financial impact on town centre facilities than the ASDA and Sainsburys proposals and, given that the new South Quay scheme will replace part of the committed harbour development, the current South Quay proposal is preferred over the Actoris/Morrisons scheme on the Jewsons site.</p> <p>All four applications must be determined having regard to the sequential approach site selection. Adopting this approach means wherever possible seeking to focus new retail development within, or failing that on well located sites on the edge of existing centres. Only if town centre or edge of centre sites are not available will out of centre will out of centre locations be likely to be appropriate provided that they are served by alternative means of transport and are acceptable in all other respects including their impact. In this instance, the South Quay and Jewsons sites can be classified as edge of centre whilst the ASDA and Sainsburys sites are classified as out of centre. Therefore, in retail policy terms, the South Quay and Jewsons sites lie in sequentially preferable locations and they also</p>

Hayle Supermarkets – Comments and Issues arising from Strategic Planning Committee’s Public Meeting – 19th January 2011

		have the ability to generate linked shopping trips with existing facilities in the centre of Hayle. The ASDA and Sainsburys scheme are unlikely to generate any significant linked trips with town centre facilities.
4	<p>Planning Decision – Should be based on the best location, best design & most beneficial scheme for Hayle and not the best brand supermarket.</p> <p>The redevelopment of Hayle is paramount so support ING scheme</p>	
5	<p>Cornwall Retail Study (by GVA Grimley) identified the ING site as best location</p> <p>ING scheme the only one that satisfies all planning criteria</p> <p>Marshfield sites are greenfield, out of town and isolated, they will not encourage the regeneration of Hayle.</p> <p>Jewsons site not adjacent to Town Centre, has weaker links and does not form part of a wider regeneration package.</p> <p>South Quay offers wider benefits. Also a huge amount of other redevelopment depends on South Quay coming forward.</p> <p>Support ING Scheme</p>	See all developer responses at 12 with regard to benefits
6	<p>Object to ING scheme it is an inappropriate development within a World Heritage Site and on a Listed Building.</p> <p>It generates too much traffic.</p> <p>Redevelopment of quay should be for Harbour purposes</p> <p>EH and CABE object to ING proposal – it has failed to overcome their concerns and is contrary to PPS5.</p>	<p>CC Planning</p> <p>South Quay was listed grade II as part of a group value, and inscribed as part of the WHS, in its current condition</p> <p>The significance of South Quay to the WHS is not in doubt. However, the existing open views, derelict nature, and infilled slips, are not authentic to the period 1700-1914 for which South Quay and the WHS are inscribed.</p> <p>To assess whether the scheme is appropriate within the WHS and on a listed building, policies in PPS5 are used. This begins with ensuring there is a good understanding of the heritage asset’s significance, and balancing the effects of any harm against any public benefit. PPS5 has a presumption in favour of the conservation of heritage assets, and also support for schemes which tackle elements that detract from a WHS and provide opportunity to enhance it. It may be argued that the scheme deals with the dereliction, poor state of the quay walls and creates a viable new use for a listed building with positive effects on the regeneration of the wider area. In this respect the scheme may be</p>

Hayle Supermarkets – Comments and Issues arising from Strategic Planning Committee’s Public Meeting – 19th January 2011

		<p>appropriate.</p> <p>Historically, the uses on the quay were related to the ability to import and export goods and materials by sea. However, for the past 40 years the use of the quay for water-related industry has not sustained the repair and maintenance of the listed building, and neither does it utilise the open quay surface.</p> <p>CC Highways Any of the schemes will generate traffic. We are examining all the submitted schemes and considering which will deliver with the least impact and the greatest benefits.</p>
7	<p>What is best for the people of Hayle? Harbour has been derelict for over 30 years ING scheme will repair listed building, provide jobs, leisure and public access onto the quay. However ask that some land within scheme is set aside to be used as a site for a firestation. Will ING revert back to “Scheme A” if consent is not granted for supermarket as concerned that that consented scheme will have greater adverse impact on Hayle.</p>	<p>Comment Awaited from ING</p>
8	<p>Support development on South Quay as it is logical and puts a store at other end of town. Less traffic as people will have to travel less to access store.</p>	
9	<p>Own a shop on Penpol Terrace that has operated for 136 years. Why need any supermarket at all? GVA study refers to adverse impact on existing stores by any new scheme. Please stop or curtail all applications.</p>	<p>GVA Grimley A need has been identified for a new supermarket in Hayle to meet the gap in existing provision and stop expenditure leaking from Hayle to shops in other towns. Having regard to the size and location of each of the four proposals, the South Quay proposal is considered to be the most appropriate in terms of size, scale, financial impact and location. The South Quay application also provides a package of mitigation measures including improvements to pedestrian links with Foundry Square and Penpol Terrace including a new pedestrian bridge over Penpol Creek which will further encourage linked trips.</p>
10	<p>Committee needs to consider damage to existing traders in Hayle. There has been too much rumour, misinformation and disinformation. Please take a very carefully judged decision on our behalf.</p>	<p>GVA Grimley Careful consideration has been given by the Council and GVA to the positive and negative impacts of the proposed supermarkets. The two edge of centre proposals (South Quay and Actoris/Jewsons) have a lower financial impact upon existing traders in Hayle’s two</p>

Hayle Supermarkets – Comments and Issues arising from Strategic Planning Committee’s Public Meeting – 19th January 2011

		<p>town centres and also have the ability to encourage linked trips. The South Quay proposal is considered to be the most appropriate of all four proposal in terms of its size, scale, financial impact and location.</p> <p>The out of centre proposals promoted by ASDA and Sainsburys are considered to have a larger financial impact upon Hayle’s traders and town centres and are unlikely to generate significant levels of linked trips with existing businesses. They are also separated in terms of accessibility by the A30 which provides a barrier to movement.</p>
11	<p>The Area Action Plan for Hayle sets out three strategic themes – Heritage, Water and Environment Have these been addressed? AAP proposes water based activities and leisure within Harbour The proposal at South Quay has nothing to do with AAP. It is suitable for an out of town supermarket to be built on this quay?</p>	<p>The weight given to the Area Action Plan will be addressed in the Officer’s report.</p>
12	<p>Question to all developers – What will be the benefits to Hayle of consenting your scheme?</p>	<p>Developers proposals as submitted are as follows Morrisons – detail to follow</p> <p>Sainburys A store operated by a company that takes its colleague responsibilities seriously: 270 new jobs. A multi-million pound package of improvements to the strategic and local highway network that will resolve existing congestion, and cater for the proposed store development as well as forecast traffic growth Safe pedestrian and cycle crossing of the A30 Loggans Roundabout Improvements to the A30 footbridge to remove the steps, extend the ramps to reduce the gradient and ensure it is compliant with relevant standards Build a new footpath between Angarrack and the store Provide a new bus service from 7am to 7pm Monday to Saturday at 30 minute intervals between the store and Hayle town centres and its residential areas Removal of existing vehicles on the lorry park and remediation of contamination Transfer ownership of 26 acres of land to a new Angarrack Community Trust. Creation of a managed nature reserve which will provide an educational resource for local schools and universities as well as other visitors Creation of a new mini-green belt between the store and Angarrack The reduction of flood risk to downstream properties</p>

Hayle Supermarkets – Comments and Issues arising from Strategic Planning Committee’s Public Meeting – 19th January 2011

		<p>ING– detail to follow</p> <p>ASDA New ASDA store and petrol station 270 jobs for Local People A new community and Rugby Facility at Hayle RFC, Carwin Rise Improved A30 roundabout at Loggans Moor Secure road level signal controlled pedestrian and cycle route across A30 Improved highway access for resident of Angarrack Free ASDA Bus linking ASDA and Shopping Park to Hayle 16,930sq ft of new small business units</p>
13	<p>Concerning in town proposals – what guarantees will be in place to ensure :</p> <p>On street parking will not be removed Support is given to traders facing closure because of stores impact Traffic congestion is managed and Emergency services access to incidents within allotted times are maintained</p>	<p>CC Highways</p> <p>No proposals have been submitted that impact on areas where on street parking is permitted. Any alterations would require the appropriate traffic orders which would be looked at with any approved scheme that obtained planning consent.</p> <p>Any traffic congestion will be mitigated through any proposed highway improvements submitted to and approved by the Council as part of the planning application determination.</p> <p>GVA Grimley</p> <p>The potential impact on existing traders has been a key aspect of the Council’s consideration of these proposals and the need to protect the health of Hayle’s town centres has been an important consideration. The South Quay is considered to have the lowest impact upon existing businesses when its location, potential for linked trips and replacement of part of the existing Hayle Harbour outline planning permission are taken into account.</p>
14	<p>Concerned at Visual impact of ING scheme.</p> <p>Hayle is not another London docklands and does not need town houses on harbour it is a low lying Cornish estuary.</p> <p>Hayle does need redevelopment but not this.</p> <p>If development goes ahead please restrict the height of development</p>	<p>CC Planning</p> <p>The visual impact of the scheme will in part depend on the robust detailing of materials and hard landscaping. CABE have acknowledged the attempt to respect the local vernacular in the design of the supermarket. However, English Heritage has suggested that the housing element needs further detailing to reflect industrial character rather than suburban.</p> <p>There is no doubt that the scheme has a wider visual impact, in terms of the effect on townscape and views. However, the current open view, while it has been in existence for some 30 years, is not authentic to the time when the South Quay was in active industrial use. The scheme will provide for some views through the site across to Lelant. The height</p>

Hayle Supermarkets – Comments and Issues arising from Strategic Planning Committee’s Public Meeting – 19th January 2011

		of structures will not detract from the impact of the viaduct.
15	Traffic in town already bad enough look at impact today of one set of road work traffic lights in High Street. Morrisons refer to free parking for Hayle town centre users but existing Morrisons stores charge after 2 hours.	CC Highways There are exceptional periods such as the resurfacing works which will alswas have to occur for maintenance purposes and any future construction of consented scheme. A car park management system would need to be approved with a limit on parking as with most supermarkets. It would not be appropriate to have unlimited car parking free of charge close to the town centre.
16	Can confirm that Hayle RFC has no plan B and no interest in entering into a partnership with ING	
17	Supports above statement	
18	If ING do not get supermarket consent will we get 270 Houses?	Comment from ING Awaited
19	Morrisons - what is the cumulative impact of their scheme alongside consented South Quay scheme?	CC Highways We have asked Morrisons to assess the impact of their development along with the consented schemes and allowing for future traffic growth and whether the highway network can cope with this; we are still awaiting their answer and this will then need to be assessed by our officers when received.
20	ING – Previous proposals had no supermarket. Concerned that if consented only supermarket will get built and not the proposed extra benefits. How will wider benefits be secured and in what timescales so that a harmonious scheme is delivered?	Comment from IN awaited
21	All developers – What are your proposals for the young people in the town?	Morrisons – response to follow Sainsbury’s New educational facilities for local schools and universities in the form of a community-owned and managed nature reserve Sainsbury’s also offers local people, including school leavers real employment opportunities with comprehensive training including quality apprenticeships. ING – response to follow ASDA State of the art training facilities at new Hayle RFC to introduce young people to rugby. Opportunities to access the ASDA Young Retailer Programme including: Opportunities to participate in one-week work placements for 14-16 year old Opportunities to access 12 week apprentice programme

Hayle Supermarkets – Comments and Issues arising from Strategic Planning Committee’s Public Meeting – 19th January 2011

		Job opportunities ideal for young people within store and new business units
22	ING – How much money will ING get from selling on their consent and what will they do with the money?	Awaiting response from ING
23	No question	
24	Planners – The biggest concern is the traffic situation but only one developer has shown their solution tonight. How will the traffic issues of each scheme be addressed	CC Highways Officers are discussing each scheme with each applicant and requiring information and designs which will need to be approved if they are to involve work on the public highway. Our main concern is to mitigate and manage the effect of any approved application. The solution illustrated at the public meeting has not been approved by either the Highways Agency or Cornwall Council.
25	Would like to know what % of M&S trade come from within town and from wider area. Accept the need for another supermarket but concerned that Sainsbury’s will build over an old river bed and cause additional flooding problems. Who will pay for damage to adjacent properties if flooded?	GVA Grimley For Marks & Spencer, the submitted retail assessment provide varying information regarding its trade draw from the local area, although the range is likely to be between 13%-38%. EA Although the area where the supermarket would be built is low-lying, there is no evidence that it is a former river bed. We are satisfied that the drainage from the development would not increase the risk to surrounding properties provided that a condition is attached to any planning permission which is issued. There would therefore be no risk of flooding to properties in Angarrack.
26	All developers- will there be facilities for kids such as cinema, leisure centre, swimming pool as there is nothing for local children ?	Morrisons - response awaited Sainsburys See response to Question 21 above. ING- response awaited ASDA Opportunity to join Hayle RFC and enjoy the social and fitness benefits of membership.
27	Planning process – 4 sites and 3 operators are being proposed but does Hayle need another supermarket? If so will it be one or more? What happens if we grant one will the others go away or will they continue to pursue their schemes?	GVA Grimley There is an established need for one new appropriately sized supermarket in Hayle and it is recommendation of GVA to the Council to grant permission for one new facility only. If permission is granted for one new supermarket, it will be up to the other retailers to consider whether they wish to pursue their proposals to appeal.

Hayle Supermarkets – Comments and Issues arising from Strategic Planning Committee’s Public Meeting – 19th January 2011

28	<p>Concerned that the environmental impacts of both out of town proposals on the Angarrack valley have not been fully addressed. ASDA may be less contentious in this respect but still in a critical flood zone and will drain into an area of concern. Sainsbury’s has been turned down by the Environment Agency as they see it is unsuitable</p>	<p>EA It is not for us to make a decision on the application – we are consultees.</p> <p>In our response to the planning application, we said that we agree with Cornwall Council with respect to the Sequential Test which they have carried out. The Council has concluded that there are some sites in Hayle which would be more suitable for a development like this.</p> <p>It is the duty of Local Planning Authorities to steer new development to areas where there is the lowest probability of flooding. The Sequential Test is the means by which this is carried out.</p> <p>The site outlined for the Marsh Lane application includes a small area which is within flood zones 2 and 3 – these are zones with the highest probability of flooding. The area of the site concerned is the access road from the A30. The Sequential Test concludes that other sites in Hayle are sequentially preferable.</p> <p>We have also objected to the Marsh Lane development because we need further information on the risk posed to a nearby groundwater source of water. This information has recently arrived and we are considering it.</p> <p>We would otherwise have no objection to the proposal on the grounds of flood risk. This is because the supermarket building, car park and petrol filling station would be in flood zone 1 where there is the least probability of flooding.</p>
29	<p>ING – No mention of proposals to repair the sluice gates. Will these happen and when? How do you propose to restore Hayle Beach? Dredging is not the solution.</p>	<p>Awaiting response from ING</p>
30	<p>ING – ING is a Dutch company if current financial problems continue Will it continue to prioritise Hayle or walk away from its promises?</p>	<p>This is not a material consideration for planning</p>
31	<p>Planners have not been asked to respond to any questions</p>	<p>All questions are being logged and will endeavour to be answered</p>
32	<p>Hayle fishermen need their rights protected. They need better facilities, repairs to the harbour and walls, and the bar dredging to</p>	<p>Awaiting response from ING</p>

	improve access.												
33	Have not yet seen the proposed s106 agreements for any proposal will these be available?	<p>Morrisons - Head of Terms</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="1070 240 2107 651"> <tr> <td data-bbox="1070 240 1966 352">Financial contribution towards an improvement scheme to Foundry Square and pedestrian improvements to links between the site and Foundry Square</td> <td data-bbox="1966 240 2107 352">£330,000</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="1070 352 1966 427">Financial contribution for the provision of a bridge link between South Quay and Penpol Terrace</td> <td data-bbox="1966 352 2107 427">£500,000</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="1070 427 1966 464">Public Transport Improvements (to service provision and assoc. facilities)</td> <td data-bbox="1966 427 2107 464">£170,000</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="1070 464 1966 539">Financial contribution towards the cost of repairing / renovating the walls to South Quay</td> <td data-bbox="1966 464 2107 539">£534,495</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="1070 539 1966 651">Financial contribution towards repair, renovation, upkeep and improvement of the buildings and structures within the conservation area and world heritage site</td> <td data-bbox="1966 539 2107 651">£500,000</td> </tr> </table> <p>Sainsbury’s – Town Centre Improvements (£255,000) including: Public realm improvements to public buildings, street furniture, paving, signage, lighting and public transport infrastructure Discretionary grants to owners of commercial premises for physical improvements Funding free or discounted parking periods to encourage additional visits to the town centres Promotional activities for the town centres Town Centre Promotion (£5,000) Financial contribution to cover the costs of producing a film promoting Hayle and its town centres to be shown periodically in the Sainsbury’s shoppers’ restaurant and in other locations.</p> <p>Transport Bus(£150,000) new bus service linking the Sainsbury’s store, Hayle’s town centres and residential areas for a period of 3 years. Real time bus information to be displayed in the Sainsbury’s shoppers’ restaurant.</p> <p>Angarrack Footpath Sainsbury’s to construct a footpath on Marsh/Grist Lane (north side) between the Sainsbury’s store and Angarrack. The scope of the works would be agreed with Cornwall</p>		Financial contribution towards an improvement scheme to Foundry Square and pedestrian improvements to links between the site and Foundry Square	£330,000	Financial contribution for the provision of a bridge link between South Quay and Penpol Terrace	£500,000	Public Transport Improvements (to service provision and assoc. facilities)	£170,000	Financial contribution towards the cost of repairing / renovating the walls to South Quay	£534,495	Financial contribution towards repair, renovation, upkeep and improvement of the buildings and structures within the conservation area and world heritage site	£500,000
Financial contribution towards an improvement scheme to Foundry Square and pedestrian improvements to links between the site and Foundry Square	£330,000												
Financial contribution for the provision of a bridge link between South Quay and Penpol Terrace	£500,000												
Public Transport Improvements (to service provision and assoc. facilities)	£170,000												
Financial contribution towards the cost of repairing / renovating the walls to South Quay	£534,495												
Financial contribution towards repair, renovation, upkeep and improvement of the buildings and structures within the conservation area and world heritage site	£500,000												

		<p>Council and is subject to obtaining all necessary approvals.</p> <p>Ecology Remediation of Lorry Park Creation of a Nature Reserve Sainsbury’s to undertake works required to create a Nature Reserve and associated visitor Facilities. Transfer the freehold of approximately 10.46ha of land comprising the proposed Nature Reserve to a new Angarrack Community Trust at nil cost in perpetuity. Sainsbury’s to cover reasonable set-up costs of the Angarrack Community Trust and to provide reasonable legal and other support during the set-up period.</p> <p>Annual Management(£51,000) Sainsbury’s to secure and initiate appropriate management of the Nature Reserve by an appropriate wildlife organisation(s). A requirement for ongoing management is to be contained in the Angarrack Community Trust constitution. Financial contribution to cover the reasonable annual management costs of the Nature Reserve for 20 years.</p> <p>ING – awaiting response</p> <p>ASDA – Head of Terms A covenant to pay £500,000.00 towards a Hoppa bus service linking the proposed Asda store with Hayle's town centres; A covenant to pay £25,000.00 towards enhanced street furniture between the Asda store and the town centres; and A covenant not to commence work on the proposed Asda store until after the rugby club have built their proposed new relocation facility and it is available for their use.</p>
34	If you are putting information on the Internet please use John Bennett’s website as you can’t find anything on the Council’s web site.	A link to the Council’s “What’s New in Planning” page will made available from John Bennett’s and Hayle Town Council’s web sites.
35	Please do not delegate s.106 decisions to officers rather bring documents back to committee and consult the people of Hayle	Scheme of delegation exists that is applicable in this instance but will officers will engage with Local Cornwall Council Members and Hayle Town Council